

TACTRAN BUS AND CT/DRT STRATEGY

Appraisal Report

Report

May 2008

Prepared for:

TACTRAN

Prepared by:

Steer Davies Gleave
68-70 George Street
Edinburgh
EH2 2LR

+44 (0)131 226 9500
www.steerdaviesgleave.com

Contents	Page
1. INTRODUCTION	1
Appraisal: Low Cost Package	1
Appraisal: Medium Cost Package	1
Appraisal: High Cost Package	1
2. APPRAISAL SUMMARY	7
Preferred package	21
Appraisal: Preferred package	22
Prioritisation	25

TABLES

Table 1.1	Strategy objectives and high level RTS objectives
Table 1.2	Appraisal against objectives: low cost package
Table 1.3	Appraisal against objectives: medium cost package
Table 1.4	Appraisal against objectives: high cost package
Table 2.1	Appraisal summary table: low cost scenario
Table 2.2	Appraisal summary table: medium cost scenario
Table 2.3	Appraisal summary table: high cost scenario
Table 2.4	Appraisal against objectives: Preferred package
Table 2.5	Strategic themes prioritised
Table 2.6	Appraisal Summary Table: Preferred package

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The draft strategy that has been distributed for consultation amongst stakeholders outlines three different packages of options as follows:
- Low cost package;
 - Medium cost package; and
 - High cost package.
- 1.2 Each package has been appraised against the objectives of the strategy in order to identify which package provides the greatest benefit in terms of achieving these objectives. Table 1.1 below provides a reminder of the objectives of the strategy and Table 1.2 to Table 1.4 shows the results of this appraisal.
- 1.3 The relative merits of each action within each package have been appraised against each objective using the following scale:
- ✓✓✓ Significant benefit
 - ✓✓ Moderate benefit
 - ✓ Slight benefit
 - o Neutral impact
 - X Slight negative
 - XX Moderate negative
 - XXX Significant negative
- 1.4 The results of this detailed appraisal process are subsequently summarised in a series of Appraisal Summary Tables (ASTs). These tables provide a general summary of the overall impact of each package on the strategy objectives.
- 1.5 An initial implementability appraisal has also been undertaken at this stage to identify any major technical, operational, financial or public constraints contained within each package that may impact on their delivery.
- 1.6 Stakeholder consultation on the draft strategy has recently been completed and the comments and responses received through this process will feed into a more detailed assessment of the acceptability and implementability of each action. This information will then be used to identify the optimum package of measures to make up the final strategy.

TABLE 1.1 STRATEGY OBJECTIVES AND HIGH LEVEL RTS OBJECTIVES

RTS High level strategic objectives	Strategy objectives
<p>Accessibility, equality and social inclusion: To improve accessibility for all, particularly for those suffering from social exclusion.</p>	<p>1 To ensure that everyone across the region has access to a key regional centre, where they can access a range of services, facilities and opportunities.</p>
	<p>2 To remove physical, financial and perceptual barriers to accessing road based passenger transport services and infrastructure.</p>
	<p>3 To enable patients and visitors to access necessary health facilities by road based passenger transport</p>
	<p>4 To ensure a level of information provision across the whole road based passenger transport network that promotes its use and does not hinder accessibility.</p>
<p>Economy: To ensure transport helps to deliver regional prosperity</p>	<p>5 To ensure that key employment, education, retail and tourism locations are linked to the passenger transport network by a service that meets the needs of the local economy.</p>
	<p>6 To achieve improvements in journey times and the reliability of the region's road based passenger transport network.</p>
<p>Environment: To ensure that the transport system contributes to safeguarding the environment and promotes opportunities for improvement.</p>	<p>7 To enhance the environmental standards of the road based passenger transport fleet and infrastructure.</p>
	<p>8 To achieve greater use of road based passenger transport services in place of travel by private car</p>
<p>Health and well-being: To promote the health and well-being of communities.</p>	<p>9 To increase physical activity and improve access to leisure opportunities across the region by road based passenger transport.</p>
<p>Safety and security: To improve the real and perceived safety and security of the transport network.</p>	<p>10 To provide for and improve the safety of passengers when travelling on the road based passenger transport network.</p>
<p>Integration: To improve integration, both within transport and between transport and other policy areas.</p>	<p>11 To increase connectivity between road based passenger transport services and between different modes of transport</p>
	<p>12 To strengthen the links between land-use planning and provision of road based passenger transport</p>

Appraisal: Low Cost Package

Scale of assessment: ✓ - Slight benefit, ✓✓ - Moderate benefit, ✓✓✓ - Significant benefit, o - neutral, X – slight negative, XX – moderate negative, XXX – significant negative impact.

TABLE 1.2 APPRAISAL AGAINST OBJECTIVES: COW COST PACKAGE

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
Infrastructure and vehicles	IV1	Existing interchanges	Establish hierarchy of existing interchanges	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓
	IV2	New interchanges	Assess requirement for new interchanges	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓
	IV3	P&R	Develop priority site designs	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓
	IV4	Cycle and walking	Enhance signage between key interchanges	✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓
	IV5	Buses	Increase the proportion of low floor / low emission vehicles operating on supported services	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	o	o	o
	IV6	CT/DRT vehicles	Ensure that all new CT / DRT vehicles are DDA compliant	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓✓	o	o
	IV7	Bus stops	Prioritise bus corridors and individual sites	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	o	o
	IV8	Environmental sustainability	Promote sustainable construction, maintenance and operations at all new facilities.	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	o	o	o	✓✓
Safety and security	SS1	Whole journey approach	Develop an approach to passenger safety that considers the whole journey	o	✓✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o
	SS2	CCTV	Identify and prioritise opportunities for enhancing CCTV provision on vehicles and at key facilities	o	✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓	o	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
	SS3	Staff at interchanges	Explore opportunities for increasing the level of staffing at key facilities in TACTRAN	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	✓✓	o	o
	SS4	Lighting	Prepare a prioritised programme of lighting improvements at bus stops and interchanges	o	✓	o	o	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o
	SS5	Driver training	Monitor driver training in TACTRAN	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	o	o
	SS6	User safety	Market and publicise safety improvements	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o
			In partnership with local authorities monitor the safety of school pick up point and vehicles	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓	✓	o
			Identify opportunities to improve the safety of school pick up points and vehicles	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	✓	o
	SS7	Mobility difficulties	Undertake and annual review of travel difficulties experienced by disabled people	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	o	✓	✓	✓	o
Network coverage	NC1	Access to key destinations	Work in partnership to identify key sites	✓	o	✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	✓✓
	NC2	Pattern and frequency of bus services	Work in partnership with operators and local authorities to develop existing bus network	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓
	NC3	Supported bus services	Review performance of existing supported bus network	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓
	NC4	Accession model	Review coverage of scheduled road based public transport	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓
	NC6	Statutory co-ordination	Work in partnership to assist in delivering statutory duties in relation to service provision	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	o	✓	o	✓	✓✓	o
	NC7	DRT provision	Work in partnership to assist in dissemination of good practice and skills across TACTRAN region	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
			Work in partnership to identify opportunities where services can be improved through the provision of DRT	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	o
Journey times, reliability and demand management	JR1	Bus priority	Identify and prioritise key strategic corridors	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	o
	JR2	PIPS	Facilitate the delivery of punctuality improvement partnerships within TACTRAN	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o
	JR3	Parking	Develop a region wide parking strategy	o	o	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓
	JR4	Travel demand management	Integrate development and marketing of bus network with development of TDM measures	o	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓
Fares and Ticketing	FT1	Concessionary fares	Lobby Government to extend concession to DRT services	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o
	FT2	Integrated ticketing	Work in partnership to explore opportunities for multi-operator, multi-modal, and multi-journey tickets	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
	FT3	Smartcards	Facilitate development of smartcards	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
	FT4	Salary Sacrifice Scheme	Provide publicity for existing salary sacrifice schemes	✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
	FT5	Travel discount Schemes	Provide publicity for existing travel discount schemes	✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
	FT6	Access to health	Work in partnership to clarify eligibility for health needs transport	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	o	o
	Provide publicity for health needs transport		✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	o	o	
Administration, partnership and funding	AP1	Quality partnerships	Explore opportunities to introduce quality partnerships	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	AP2	Enforcement	Work in partnership to ensure adequate enforcement of TROs that support efficient	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
			bus service provision												
	AP3	CT/DRT booking	Coordinate provision of CT / DRT booking information	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o
	AP4	Bus funding	Lobby Government to re-start pump prime funding for new and improved services and infrastructure	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
	AP5	CT/DRT Funding	Work in partnership to identify and tap existing and potential sources of funding for CT / DRT schemes	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓
			Work with local authorities to ensure appropriate grant funding is provided for CT schemes	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓

Appraisal: Medium Cost Package

Scale of assessment: ✓ - Slight benefit, ✓✓ - Moderate benefit, ✓✓✓ - Significant benefit, o - neutral, X – slight negative, XX – moderate negative, XXX – significant negative impact.

TABLE 1.3 APPRAISAL AGAINST OBJECTIVES: MEDIUM COST PACKAGE

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives												
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
Infrastructure and vehicles	IV1	Existing interchanges	Establish hierarchy of existing interchanges	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	
			Implement improvements to priority sites	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓	o	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
	IV2	New interchanges	Assess requirement for new interchanges	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓
			Implement priority sites	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
	IV3	P&R	Develop priority site designs	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓
			Implement priority sites	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓
	IV4	Cycle and walking	Enhance signage, footways and cycleways between key interchanges	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
	IV5	Buses	All vehicles on supported services to be low floor / low emission vehicles	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓	✓	o	o	o	o
	IV6	CT/DRT vehicles	Ensure that all new CT / DRT vehicles are DDA compliant	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓✓	o	o	
	IV7	Bus stops	Prioritise bus corridors and individual sites	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	o	o	
			Enhance bus stops on priority corridors / individual sites	✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓✓	o	o	o	
	IV8	Environmental sustainability	Promote sustainable construction, maintenance and operations at all new facilities.	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	o	o	o	✓✓
			Promote sustainable construction,	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives													
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12		
			maintenance and operations at prioritised existing facilities														
Safety and security	SS1	Whole journey approach	Develop an approach to passenger safety that considers the whole journey	o	✓✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o		
	SS2	CCTV	Identify and prioritise opportunities for enhancing CCTV provision on vehicles and at key facilities	o	✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓	o	o		
			Facilitate implementation of CCTV on vehicles and at priority key facilities	o	✓✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	o		
	SS3	Staff at interchanges	Explore opportunities for increasing the level of staffing at key facilities in TACTRAN	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	✓✓	o	o		
			Facilitate consistent training for staff at key facilities	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o		
	SS4	Lighting	Prepare a prioritised programme of lighting improvements at bus stops and interchanges	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	
			Facilitate implementation of improved lighting at priority bus stops and interchanges	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	
	SS5	Driver training	Monitor driver training in TACTRAN	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	o	o	
			Facilitate driver training on key routes	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	
	SS6	User safety	Market and publicise safety improvements	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o	
			Provide advice to travellers who may be using road based public transport for the first time in TACTRAN region	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o	
			In partnership with local authorities monitor the safety of school pick up point and vehicles	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓	✓	o
			Identify opportunities to improve the safety of	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	✓	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives												
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
			school pick up points and vehicles													
			Facilitate improvements at priority sites and on priority routes	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	✓	o
			Undertake periodic surveys to gain better understanding of key barriers to travel	✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o
	SS7	Mobility difficulties	Undertake and annual review of travel difficulties experienced by disabled people	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	o	✓	✓	✓	o	
			Facilitate improvements to address priority problems	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	o	
Network coverage	NC1	Access to key destinations	Work in partnership to identify key sites	✓	o	✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	✓✓	
			Work in partnership to ensure minimum levels of service provision are achieved	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	✓✓	
	NC2	Pattern and frequency of bus services	Work in partnership with operators and local authorities to develop existing bus network	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	
	NC3	Supported bus services	Review performance of existing supported bus network	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	
	NC4	Accession model	Review coverage of scheduled road based public transport	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	
	NC5	New development	Develop region wide development control standards	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	
	NC6	Statutory co-ordination	Work in partnership to assist in delivering statutory duties in relation to service provision	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	o	✓	o	✓	✓✓	o10	
	NC7	DRT provision	Work in partnership to assist in dissemination of good practice and skills across TACTRAN region	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
			Work in partnership to identify opportunities where services can be improved through the provision of DRT	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	o
			Work in partnership to help deliver new DRT schemes within TACTRAN	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o
Journey times, reliability and demand management	JR1	Bus priority	Identify and prioritise key strategic corridors	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	o
			Facilitate delivery of bus priority on priority strategic corridors	✓	✓	✓	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓	o	o	o
	JR2	PIPS	Facilitate the delivery of punctuality improvement partnerships within TACTRAN	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o
	JR3	Parking	Develop a region wide parking strategy	o	o	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓
			Facilitate the Delivery of a region wide parking strategy	o	o	o	o	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓
JR4	Travel demand management	Integrate development and marketing of bus network with development of TDM measures	o	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	
Fares and Ticketing	FT1	Concessionary fares	Lobby Government to extend concession to DRT services	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o
	FT2	Integrated ticketing	Work in partnership to explore opportunities for multi-operator, multi-modal, and multi-journey tickets	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
			Facilitate the implementation of multi-operator, multi-modal, and multi-journey tickets	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o
	FT3	Smartcards	Facilitate development of smartcards	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
			Facilitate implementation of smartcards	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o
	FT4	Salary Sacrifice	Provide publicity for existing salary sacrifice	✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
		Scheme	schemes												
			Explore opportunities for increasing the number of salary sacrifice schemes	✓	✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o
	FT5	Travel discount Schemes	Provide publicity for existing travel discount schemes	✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
			Explore opportunities for increasing the range of travel discount schemes	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o
	FT6	Access to health	Work in partnership to clarify eligibility for health needs transport	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	o	o
			Provide publicity for health needs transport	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	o	o
Administration, partnership and funding	AP1	Quality partnerships	Explore opportunities to introduce quality partnerships	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
			Facilitate the implementation of quality partnerships	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓
	AP2	Enforcement	Work in partnership to ensure adequate enforcement of TROs that support efficient bus service provision	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	o	
	AP3	CT/DRT booking	Coordinate provision of CT / DRT booking information	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o
			Manage booking service for CT / DRT services	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	o	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o
	AP4	Bus funding	Lobby Government to re-start pump prime funding for new and improved services and infrastructure	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
AP5	CT/DRT Funding	Work in partnership to identify and tap existing and potential sources of funding for CT / DRT	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
			schemes												
			Work with local authorities to ensure appropriate grant funding is provided for CT schemes	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	0	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓

Appraisal: High Cost Package

Scale of assessment: ✓ - Slight benefit, ✓✓ - Moderate benefit, ✓✓✓ - Significant benefit, o - neutral, X – slight negative, XX – moderate negative, XXX – significant negative impact.

TABLE 1.4 APPRAISAL AGAINST OBJECTIVES: HIGH COST PACKAGE

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives												
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
Infrastructure and vehicles	IV1	Existing interchanges	Establish hierarchy of existing interchanges	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	
			Implement improvements to all sites	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓
	IV2	New interchanges	Assess requirement for new interchanges	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	
			Implement all new sites	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓
	IV3	P&R	Develop and implement all feasible sites	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	
	IV4	Cycle and walking	Enhance signage, footways and cycleways between all associated interchanges	✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	
	IV5	Buses	All vehicles operating in TACTRAN to be low floor / low emissions vehicles	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓	o	o	o	
			Introduce zero emission vehicles on key routes	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓	o	o	o	
	IV6	CT/DRT vehicles	Ensure that all new CT / DRT vehicles are DDA compliant	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓✓	o	o	
	IV7	Bus stops	Prioritise bus corridors and individual sites	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	o	o	
			Enhance all bus stops in TACTRAN area	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	o	
	IV8	Environmental sustainability	Promote sustainable construction, maintenance and operations at all new facilities.	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	✓✓
			Promote sustainable construction,	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	o	o	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives												
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
			maintenance and operations at all existing facilities													
Safety and security	SS1	Whole journey approach	Develop an approach to passenger safety that considers the whole journey	o	✓✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	
	SS2	CCTV	Identify and prioritise opportunities for enhancing CCTV provision on vehicles and at key facilities	o	✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓	o	o	
			Facilitate implementation of CCTV on all vehicles at all key facilities in TACTRAN	o	✓✓✓	o	o	✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	o	
	SS3	Staff at interchanges	Explore opportunities for increasing the level of staffing at key facilities in TACTRAN	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	✓✓	o	o	
			Provide funding to increase levels of trained staff at key facilities	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	o	
	SS4	Lighting	Prepare a prioritised programme of lighting improvements at bus stops and interchanges	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o
			Facilitate implementation of improved lighting at all bus stops and interchanges	o	✓✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	o
	SS5	Driver training	Monitor driver training in TACTRAN	o	✓	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	o	o
			Facilitate driver train on key routes	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o
			Facilitate driver training on all routes	o	✓✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	o
	SS6	User safety	Market and publicise safety improvements	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o
			Provide advice to travellers who may be using road based public transport for the first time in TACTRAN region	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o
In partnership with local authorities monitor the safety of school pick up point and vehicles			o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓	✓	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives													
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12		
			Identify opportunities to improve the safety of school pick up points and vehicles	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓	✓	o		
			Facilitate improvements at all sites and on all routes	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓	o	
			Undertake periodic surveys to gain better understanding of key barriers to travel	✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	o	✓✓	✓	✓	✓	o	
	SS7	Mobility difficulties	Undertake and annual review of travel difficulties experienced by disabled people	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	o	o	✓	✓	✓	o	
			Facilitate improvements to address all problems	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	o	o	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	
Network coverage	NC1	Access to key destinations	Work in partnership to identify key sites	✓	o	✓	o	✓	o	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	✓✓	
			Work in partnership to ensure minimum levels of service provision are achieved	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	✓✓	
			Provide funding to establish new services	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓	✓✓✓	
	NC2	Pattern and frequency of bus services	Work in partnership with operators and local authorities to develop existing bus network	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	
	NC3	Supported bus services	Review performance of existing supported bus network	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	
	NC4	Accession model	Review coverage of scheduled road based public transport	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	
	NC5	New development	Develop region wide development control standards	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	
	NC6	Statutory co-ordination	Work in partnership to assist in delivering statutory duties in relation to service provision	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	o	o	o	✓	o	✓	✓✓	o10
	NC7	DRT provision	Work in partnership to assist in dissemination	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
			of good practice and skills across TACTRAN region												
			Work in partnership to identify opportunities where services can be improved through the provision of DRT	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	o
			Work in partnership to help deliver new DRT schemes within TACTRAN	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o
			Work in partnership to establish a region wide DRT scheme	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓
Journey times, reliability and demand management	JR1	Bus priority	Identify and prioritise key strategic corridors	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	o
			Facilitate delivery of bus priority on all strategic corridors	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	o
	JR2	PIPS	Facilitate the delivery of punctuality improvement partnerships within TACTRAN	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o
	JR3	Parking	Develop a region wide parking strategy	o	o	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓
			Facilitate the Delivery of a region wide parking strategy	o	o	o	o	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓
JR4	Travel demand management	Integrate development and marketing of bus network with development of TDM measures	o	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	
Fares and Ticketing	FT1	Concessionary fares	Lobby Government to extend concession to DRT services	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o
	FT2	Integrated ticketing	Work in partnership to explore opportunities for multi-operator, multi-modal, and multi-journey tickets	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	✓	o
			Facilitate the implementation of multi-operator, multi-modal, and multi-journey tickets	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
	FT3	Smartcards	Manage the operation of multi-operator, multi-modal, and multi-journey tickets	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	○	○	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	○	✓✓✓	○
			Facilitate development of smartcards	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	○	○	✓	✓	○	✓	○
			Facilitate implementation of smartcards	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	○	○	✓✓	✓✓	○	✓✓	○
	FT4	Salary Sacrifice Scheme	Manage the operation of smartcards	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	○	○	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	○	✓✓✓	○
			Provide publicity for existing salary sacrifice schemes	✓	✓	○	✓✓✓	✓	✓	○	✓	✓	○	✓	○
			Explore opportunities for increasing the number of salary sacrifice schemes	✓	✓✓	○	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	○	✓✓	✓✓	○	✓	○
	FT5	Travel discount Schemes	Facilitate the delivery of new salary sacrifice schemes	✓	✓✓✓	○	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	○	✓✓✓	✓✓	○	✓	○
			Provide publicity for existing travel discount schemes	✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	○	○	✓	✓	○	✓	○
			Explore opportunities for increasing the range of travel discount schemes	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	○	○	✓✓	✓✓	○	✓✓	○
	FT6	Access to health	Facilitate the delivery of new travel discount schemes	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	○	○	✓✓	✓✓✓	○	✓✓	○
			Work in partnership to clarify eligibility for health needs transport	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	○	○	○	✓	○	✓	○	○
	Administration, partnership and funding	AP1	Quality partnerships	Provide publicity for health needs transport	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	○	○	○	✓	○	✓	○
				Explore opportunities to introduce quality partnerships	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	AP2	Enforcement	Facilitate the implementation of quality partnerships	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓
			Work in partnership to ensure adequate	○	○	○	○	○	✓✓	○	✓	○	○	○	○

Strategic category	Strategic Themes		Strategic measures and activities	Objectives											
	Code	Name		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
			enforcement of TROs that support efficient bus service provision												
			Provide funding to support adequate enforcement of TROs that support efficient bus service provision	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o
	AP3	CT/DRT booking	Coordinate provision of CT / DRT booking information	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o
			Manage booking service for CT / DRT services	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	o	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o
	AP4	Bus funding	Lobby Government to re-start pump prime funding for new and improved services and infrastructure	✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
	AP5	CT/DRT Funding	Work in partnership to identify and tap existing and potential sources of funding for CT / DRT schemes	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓
Work with local authorities to ensure appropriate grant funding is provided for CT schemes			✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	

2. APPRAISAL SUMMARY

2.1 The following tables provide a summary of the appraisal contained in the previous section.

TABLE 2.1 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLE: LOW COST SCENARIO

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:		TACTRAN	
Proposal Name:	Bus and Community / Demand Responsive Transport Strategy – Low Cost Scenario	Name of Planner:	
Proposal Description:	This strategy sets out the principles and short, medium and long term actions by which TACTRAN will maintain and improve the bus, community and demand responsive transport network across the region.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	Capital costs/grant:
			Annual revenue support:
			Present Value of Cost to Govt:
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)		Amount of Application:	Sum: Costs will be in the order of £2 million
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	This strategy covers the TACTRAN Regional Transport Partnership area which encompasses the local authority areas of Angus, Dundee City, Perth and Kinross and Stirling. The region includes parts of the Loch Lomond and Trossachs and Cairngorms National Parks.		
Social Context:	The total population of the region is currently around 475,000 people. It is forecast to remain relatively stable during the lifetime of this strategy. Almost two thirds of the region's population live in the largest cities and towns of Dundee (145,600), Perth (43,500), Stirling (41,000), Arbroath (22,800), Forfar (13,200) and Montrose (10,800). Approximately 10% of the population lives in small towns of between 3,000 – 10,000 people and a quarter of the population lives in rural communities of populations less than 3,000 people. Approximately 31% of TACTRAN households do not have access to a car – this rises to over 48% for lone		

	parent households and to 69% for single pensioner households. Access to healthcare facilities for those without access to a car is a key issue, particularly following centralisation of services.
Economic Context:	The RTS highlights that there are connectivity problems between existing and new locations of housing, employment and key services in certain parts of the region. There is dispersed economic activity, and ongoing dispersion of population out of traditional centres which is increasing the need to travel. Timing, speed, frequency and cost of public transport options to major centres are not perceived to be optimal. Tourism is a key sector of the region's economy and there is a need for increased promotion of the region as a tourist destination. General congestion within the city and town centres at peak times has an impact on bus reliability and links to external markets.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
To ensure that everyone across the region has access to a key regional centre, where they can access a range of services, facilities and opportunities	Overall this package provides a slight to moderate benefit towards this objective. The majority of actions are aimed at identifying opportunities and priorities for improvement with the intention that the delivery of these would be undertaken by the individual local authorities, rather than TACTRAN itself. The most significant contributions to this objective come from actions to work in partnership with operators and local authorities to develop the existing bus network and to review the coverage and operation of the scheduled road based passenger transport network and the performance of the existing supported services. In addition the action to work with local authorities to ensure appropriate grant funding for CT/DRT would provide a significant benefit towards achieving this objective.
To remove physical, financial and perceptual barriers to accessing road based passenger transport services and infrastructure	Overall this package provides a slight benefit towards this objective with the majority of actions being scored as slightly beneficial for the same reasons as above. The actions contributing significantly to this objective relate to the marketing and publicity of safety improvements, the facilitation of Punctuality Improvement Partnerships which would improve reliability perceptions and to lobby the Scottish Government to extend concessionary fares scheme to CT/DRT services which, if successful would provide significant financial benefits for those eligible.
To enable patients and visitors to access necessary health facilities by road based passenger transport	Overall this package provides a slight to moderate benefit towards this objective with the majority of actions being scored as slightly beneficial for the same reasons as objective 1 above. This package does however contain some actions specifically aimed at health transport (see FT5 and FT6) which will significantly contribute to achieving this objective. Actions to work in partnership with operators and local authorities to develop the existing bus network and to review the coverage and operation of the scheduled road based passenger transport network and the performance of existing supported services will also significantly contribute to achieving this objective.
To ensure a level of information provision across the whole road based passenger transport network that	Although some actions within this package will significantly contribute towards achieving this objective, the majority of actions will have a slightly beneficial or neutral impact.

<p>promotes its use and does not hinder accessibility</p>	
<p>To ensure that key employment, education, retail and tourism locations are linked to the passenger transport network by a service that meets the needs of the local economy</p>	<p>Overall this package will have a slight to moderate benefit for this objective with the majority of actions being scored as slightly beneficial for the same reasons as outlined in objective 1. The most significant contributions to this objective come from actions to work in partnership with operators and local authorities to develop the existing bus network and to review the coverage and operation of the scheduled road based passenger transport network and the performance of the existing supported services. In addition the action to work with local authorities to ensure appropriate grant funding for CT/DRT would provide a significant benefit towards achieving this objective.</p>
<p>To achieve improvements in journey times and the reliability of the region's road based passenger transport network</p>	<p>Overall this package provides only a slight positive contribution towards this objective. The only action contained within this package that will significantly contribute to achieving journey time and reliability improvements is the delivery of Punctuality Improvement Partnerships. A small number of other actions will bring more indirect benefits through better enforcement of parking and bus lanes to remove some of the barriers that cause delays to buses such as parked cars.</p>
<p>To enhance the environmental standards of the road based passenger transport fleet and infrastructure</p>	<p>This package will bring only slight benefits to this objective as few of the actions have the potential to improve the environmental standards of the fleet or infrastructure. The most beneficial actions include those to lobby for additional funding for bus or CT/DRT services, either through pump prime funding from central government or grant funding from local authorities or other sources. Funding to improve services could also be used to enhance the vehicle fleet and improve infrastructure with opportunities to improve their environmental standards (e.g. emissions levels).</p>
<p>To achieve greater use of road based passenger transport services in place of travel by private car</p>	<p>This package of actions will bring slight to moderate benefits against this objective. All actions included within this package are designed to make road based passenger transport services more attractive and encourage greater use of them. It is anticipated that these improvements will result in some mode shift away from the private car, although this is likely to be limited as provision of new services and infrastructure within this package will be limited.</p>
<p>To increase physical activity and improve access to leisure opportunities across the region by road based passenger transport</p>	<p>This package will contribute to increasing physical activity and improving access to leisure opportunities, although the impacts are only anticipated to be slight to moderately beneficial. The most significant contributions to this objective come from actions to work in partnership with operators and local authorities to develop the existing bus network and to review the coverage and operation of the scheduled road based passenger transport network and the performance of the existing supported services. In addition the action to work with local authorities to ensure appropriate grant funding for CT/DRT would provide a significant benefit towards achieving this objective.</p>
<p>To provide for and improve the safety of passengers when travelling on the road based passenger transport network</p>	<p>Overall slight contribution to this objective as the focus is on identifying priorities for action to be delivered by key stakeholders at a local level rather than by TACTRAN. A number of actions are included specifically aimed at improving safety, however again these are aimed at identifying and prioritising necessary improvements</p>

	rather than on their, which would be carried out at a local level.	
To increase connectivity between road based passenger transport services and between different modes of transport	Overall slight beneficial impact on this objective. All actions are predicted to have a beneficial or neutral contribution with no actions predicted to have a negative impact. Many of the actions contained within the strategy will contribute to increasing connectivity, particularly those related to prioritising sites for interchange and improving signage on walking and cycling links.	
To strengthen the links between land-use planning and provision of road based passenger transport	This package supports provides an overall slight beneficial impact towards achieving this objective. All actions provide a positive or neutral impact with no actions predicted to have a negative impact against this objective. This package supports the principles of regional and local land use planning documents, however the lack of focus on delivery means that the contribution to this objective is fairly limited.	
Implementability Appraisal		
Technical:	It is not anticipated that there will be any technical constraints to the delivery of this package.	
Operational:	There are not thought to be any significant operational constraints to the delivery of this package. Joint working between a range of different stakeholders will be required; however this happens already to a certain extent and is not a barrier to implementation.	
Financial:	This is the low cost scenario of the three that have been developed and is therefore the cheapest to deliver. The majority of the actions are review and prioritisation exercises and therefore require limited funding beyond that of staff time. There is a very limited 'on the ground delivery' element for TACTRAN within this package of options.	
Public:	It is felt that there are no actions contained within this package that are not acceptable to the public or to key stakeholders, however consultation responses will feed into a more detailed appraisal of this aspect. It may however be felt, particularly by stakeholders, that this package does not go far enough in improving the road based passenger transport network across the region in terms of meeting the objectives and in delivering on the ground improvements.	
Rational for selection / rejection of proposal	Summary: overall this package will only provide a slight contribution to the objectives of this strategy. In addition, it is not felt that this package will deliver significant improvements to the road based passenger transport network of the region over the 15 year lifespan of the strategy.	
Government's Objectives for Transport		
Objective	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	N/A ¹	N/A

¹ An assessment against the five STAG criteria will be undertaken on the preferred package once it has been identified.

Safety:	N/A	N/A
Economy:	N/A	N/A
Integration:	N/A	N/A
Accessibility & Social Inclusion:	N/A	N/A

TABLE 2.2 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLE: MEDIUM COST SCENARIO

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:		TACTRAN	
Proposal Name:	Bus and Community / Demand Responsive Transport Strategy – Medium Cost Scenario	Name of Planner:	
Proposal Description:	<p>This strategy sets out the principles and short, medium and long term actions by which TACTRAN will maintain and improve the bus, community and demand responsive transport network across the region.</p> <p>This package contains a number of the actions that are also contained within the low cost package as well as a range of additional actions more focussed on delivery of improvements at priority sites and corridors.</p>	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	Capital costs/grant:
			<i>Annual revenue support:</i>
			<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt:</i>
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)		Amount of Application:	<i>Sum: Costs will be in the order of £36 million</i>
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	This strategy covers the TACTRAN Regional Transport Partnership area which encompasses the local authority areas of Angus, Dundee City, Perth and Kinross and Stirling. The region includes parts of the Loch Lomond and Trossachs and Cairngorms National Parks.		
Social Context:	The total population of the region is currently around 475,000 people. It is forecast to remain relatively stable during the lifetime of this strategy. Almost two thirds of the region's population live in the largest cities and towns of Dundee (145,600), Perth (43,500), Stirling (41,000), Arbroath (22,800), Forfar (13,200) and Montrose (10,800). Approximately 10% of the population lives in small towns of between 3,000 – 10,000 people and a quarter of the population lives in rural communities of populations less than 3,000 people. Approximately 31% of TACTRAN households do not have access to a car – this rises to over 48% for lone		

	parent households and to 69% for single pensioner households. Access to healthcare facilities for those without access to a car is a key issue, particularly following centralisation of services.
Economic Context:	The RTS highlights that there are connectivity problems between existing and new locations of housing, employment and key services in certain parts of the region. There is dispersed economic activity, and ongoing dispersion of population out of traditional centres which is increasing the need to travel. Timing, speed, frequency and cost of public transport options to major centres is not perceived to be optimal. Tourism is a key sector of the region's economy and there is a need for increased promotion of the region as a tourist destination. General congestion within the city and town centres at peak times has an impact on bus reliability and links to external markets.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
To ensure that everyone across the region has access to a key regional centre, where they can access a range of services, facilities and opportunities	Overall, this package of measures brings moderate benefits towards achieving this objective. This package focuses on implementing improvements to priority existing and new interchange sites, including park and ride, enhancing the accessibility of the supported bus fleet, reviewing the performance and coverage of the existing bus fleet.
To remove physical, financial and perceptual barriers to accessing road based passenger transport services and infrastructure	Overall moderate to significant benefits towards achieving this objective. Improvements to priority existing and new interchange sites will aim to ensure they are safe and secure, clean, well lit, well signed and user friendly, provide clear information, comfortable, accessible and well linked to the walking / cycling network. Such improvements will contribute to removing many perceptual and accessibility barriers to the network. Enhancements to bus stops on priority corridors will also contribute to this objective. A number of actions within this package will bring a significant benefit to this objective. None of the actions contained within this package are predicted to have a negative impact on achieving this objective.
To enable patients and visitors to access necessary health facilities by road based passenger transport	Overall moderate benefits. This package of measures includes actions to ensure all vehicles on supported services are low floor, provide advice to travellers who may be using services for the first time, provide publicity for health needs transport, undertake periodic surveys to better understand the barriers to travel and to review coverage and performance of the existing network. No actions are predicted to have a negative impact on this objective.
To ensure a level of information provision across the whole road based passenger transport network that promotes its use and does not hinder accessibility	This package contains a number of actions designed to enhance information provision, including publicity of salary sacrifice and travel discount schemes, implementation of quality partnerships, development of multi-operator / multi-journey tickets and smartcards. A number of the actions will contribute significantly to this objective, however overall it will have a moderate impact. There are not anticipated to be any negative impacts on this objective.
To ensure that key employment, education, retail and tourism locations	This package contains a number of actions that will benefit this objective and overall the benefit will be moderate to significant. Action NC1 to NC6 (Network Coverage) are particularly relevant to this objective.

are linked to the passenger transport network by a service that meets the needs of the local economy	Enhancements to the accessibility of infrastructure and vehicles will also enhance access to these sites for those with mobility difficulties. Improvements to infrastructure in this package are however generally limited to priority sites only.
To achieve improvements in journey times and the reliability of the region's road based passenger transport network	Overall moderate benefit. This package contains actions to facilitate delivery of bus priority on strategic corridors, Punctuality Improvement Partnerships, delivery of a region wide parking strategy and implementation of Quality Partnerships, all of which will contribute towards this objective. Overall the impact is moderate as a large number of the actions in this package will have a neutral impact on this objective. No actions are predicted to have a negative impact.
To enhance the environmental standards of the road based passenger transport fleet and infrastructure	Actions to promote sustainable construction, maintenance and operations at prioritised existing facilities, to facilitate improvements to lighting, implementation of quality partnerships and lobbying for funding for scheduled and CT/DRT services can all have a positive impact on this objective as they provide significant opportunity to integrate more sustainable vehicles and infrastructure into the network. Overall, this package will bring a moderate benefit against this objective.
To achieve greater use of road based passenger transport services in place of travel by private car	The majority of actions contained within this package will bring a positive benefit to achieving this objective, with the remainder having a neutral impact. The majority of actions are aimed at making the road based passenger transport network and fleet more attractive to all users and will therefore contribute to encouraging a mode shift away from the private car. Overall the impact on this objective is predicted to be moderate to significantly beneficial. Many of the actions are however only focussed on improvements to priority sites and corridors which will limit the potential benefits of this package of measures in achieving this objective.
To increase physical activity and improve access to leisure opportunities across the region by road based passenger transport	Moderate to significantly beneficial. This package of measures in general will encourage greater levels of physical activity through encouraging a mode shift away from the car to road based passenger transport, which, in general, involved increased levels of walking. Improvements to interchanges, park and ride sites, improvements to cycling and walking links to key interchanges and measures included to enhance network coverage will all contribute to achieving this objective.
To provide for and improve the safety of passengers when travelling on the road based passenger transport network	Overall moderate benefit. There are a number of actions designed specifically to improve the safety of passengers, these include improvements to interchanges (including staffing, lighting, CCTV), improvements to the accessibility of vehicles, improved driver training, CCTV on vehicles and lighting at bus stops. Delivery of these actions is however only focussed on priority sites and corridors in this package of measures which limits the overall benefits of this package.
To increase connectivity between road based passenger transport services and between different modes of transport	Overall moderate benefit. Improvements to interchanges and development of new park and ride sites, an approach to passenger safety that considers the whole journey, development of the existing bus network, development of multi-operator/multi-journey tickets and smartcards and introduction of quality partnerships will all provide a positive contribution towards this objective. Many improvements are however focussed on priority sites and corridors and therefore the overall impact is moderate. No actions within this package are forecast to have a negative impact.

To strengthen the links between land-use planning and provision of road based passenger transport	Measures included in this package that will strengthen the links between land use planning and road based passenger transport include measures to improve integration and connectivity between services and to develop region wide development control standards and a region wide parking strategy. Overall this package will have a moderately beneficial impact on this objective. There are no actions which will have a negative impact on this objective.
---	---

Implementability Appraisal

Technical:	It is not anticipated that there will be any technical constraints to the delivery of this package.
Operational:	There are not thought to be any significant operational constraints to the delivery of this package. Joint working between a number of stakeholders will be required; however this happens already to a certain extent and is not thought to be a barrier to implementation.
Financial:	This is the medium cost scenario of the three that have been developed. Although a range of improvements to infrastructure and services are identified, these will be focussed on priority sites and corridors only where it is felt that the benefits can be maximised. The costs of this package will be greater than the previous low cost scenario and the extent of improvements will be dependent on the funding that is available. The cost of this scenario is not however thought to be prohibitive over the 15 year lifespan of the strategy.
Public:	At present it is felt that there are no actions contained within this package that are not acceptable to the public or to key stakeholders, however consultation responses will feed into a more detailed appraisal of this aspect.

Rational for selection / rejection of proposal	Summary: This package will provide a moderate contribution to the objectives of this strategy over its 15 year lifetime, and will partly achieve the objectives of the strategy.
---	---

Government's Objectives for Transport

Objective	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	N/A ²	N/A
Safety:	N/A	N/A
Economy:	N/A	N/A
Integration:	N/A	N/A
Accessibility & Social Inclusion:	N/A	N/A

² An assessment against the five STAG criteria will be undertaken on the preferred package once it has been identified.

TABLE 2.3 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLE: HIGH COST SCENARIO

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:		TACTRAN	
Proposal Name:	Bus and Community / Demand Responsive Transport Strategy – High Cost Scenario	Name of Planner:	
Proposal Description:	<p>This strategy sets out the principles and short, medium and long term actions by which TACTRAN will maintain and improve the bus, community and demand responsive transport network across the region.</p> <p>This package contains a number of the actions that are also contained within the low and medium cost packages as well as a range of additional actions more focussed on delivery of improvements across the whole region.</p>	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	Capital costs/grant:
			<i>Annual revenue support:</i>
			<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt:</i>
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)		Amount of Application:	<i>Sum: Costs will be in the order of £98 million</i>
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	This strategy covers the TACTRAN Regional Transport Partnership area which encompasses the local authority areas of Angus, Dundee City, Perth and Kinross and Stirling. The region includes parts of the Loch Lomond and Trossachs and Cairngorms National Parks.		
Social Context:	The total population of the region is currently around 475,000 people. It is forecast to remain relatively stable during the lifetime of this strategy. Almost two thirds of the region's population live in the largest cities and towns of Dundee (145,600), Perth (43,500), Stirling (41,000), Arbroath (22,800), Forfar (13,200) and Montrose (10,800). Approximately 10% of the population lives in small towns of between 3,000 – 10,000 people and a quarter of the population lives in rural communities of populations less than 3,000 people. Approximately 31% of TACTRAN households do not have access to a car – this rises to over 48% for lone		

	parent households and to 69% for single pensioner households. Access to healthcare facilities for those without access to a car is a key issue, particularly following centralisation of services.
Economic Context:	The RTS highlights that there are connectivity problems between existing and new locations of housing, employment and key services in certain parts of the region. There is dispersed economic activity, and ongoing dispersion of population out of traditional centres which is increasing the need to travel. Timing, speed, frequency and cost of public transport options to major centres is not perceived to be optimal. Tourism is a key sector of the region's economy and there is a need for increased promotion of the region as a tourist destination. General congestion within the city and town centres at peak times has an impact on bus reliability and links to external markets.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
To ensure that everyone across the region has access to a key regional centre, where they can access a range of services, facilities and opportunities	Overall, this package of measures brings significant benefits towards achieving this objective. This package focuses on implementing improvements to all existing and new interchange sites, including park and ride, enhancing the accessibility of the whole bus fleet, reviewing the performance and coverage of the existing bus fleet, providing funding to establish new services and establish the delivery of new travel discount schemes.
To remove physical, financial and perceptual barriers to accessing road based passenger transport services and infrastructure	Overall significant benefits towards achieving this objective. Improvements to all existing and new interchange sites will aim to ensure they are all safe and secure, clean, well lit, well signed and user friendly, provide clear information, comfortable, accessible and well linked to the walking / cycling network. Such improvements will contribute to removing many perceptual and accessibility barriers to the network. Enhancements to all bus stops across the region will also contribute to this objective as will a range of safety improvements and actions to facilitate the delivery of travel discount and Salary Sacrifice schemes. Many actions within this package will bring a significant benefit to this objective. None of the actions contained within this package are predicted to have a negative impact on achieving this objective.
To enable patients and visitors to access necessary health facilities by road based passenger transport	Overall significant benefits. This package of measures includes actions to ensure all vehicles are low floor and that all bus stops are enhanced to complement this, provide funding to establish new services, provide publicity for health needs transport, undertake periodic surveys to better understand the barriers to travel and to review coverage and performance of the existing network. No actions are predicted to have a negative impact on this objective.
To ensure a level of information provision across the whole road based passenger transport network that promotes its use and does not hinder accessibility	This package contains a range of actions designed to enhance information provision and to complement the regional information strategy that is being developed in parallel to this strategy. Key actions that will significantly contribute to this objective include managing a regional booking service for CT/DRT services, provide advice to travellers who may be using services for the first time, integration of development and marketing of the bus network with travel demand measures and provide publicity of salary sacrifice and travel discount schemes. Many of the actions within this package will contribute significantly to this objective. There

	are not anticipated to be any negative impacts on this objective.
To ensure that key employment, education, retail and tourism locations are linked to the passenger transport network by a service that meets the needs of the local economy	This package contains a number of actions that will benefit this objective and overall the benefit will be significant. Action NC1 to NC6 (Network Coverage) are particularly relevant to this objective. Enhancements to the accessibility of infrastructure and vehicles will also enhance access to these sites for those with mobility difficulties. In comparison to the medium cost package, improvements to infrastructure in this package are extended to the whole network.
To achieve improvements in journey times and the reliability of the region's road based passenger transport network	Overall moderate to significant benefit. This package contains actions to facilitate delivery of bus priority on all strategic corridors, Punctuality Improvement Partnerships, delivery of a region wide parking strategy and implementation of Quality Partnerships, all of which will contribute towards this objective. Greater enforcement of parking regulations will help to reduce the delays to buses caused by parked cars in town centres and in bus lanes.
To enhance the environmental standards of the road based passenger transport fleet and infrastructure	Actions to promote sustainable construction, maintenance and operations at all existing facilities, to facilitate improvements to lighting, implementation of quality partnerships and lobbying for funding for scheduled and CT/DRT services can all have a positive impact on this objective as they provide significant opportunity to integrate more sustainable vehicles and infrastructure into the network. Overall, this package will bring a moderate to significant benefits against this objective.
To achieve greater use of road based passenger transport services in place of travel by private car	Many of actions contained within this package will bring a significant positive benefit to achieving this objective. The majority of actions are aimed at making the road based passenger transport network and fleet more attractive to all users and will therefore contribute to encouraging a mode shift away from the private car. Overall the impact on this objective is predicted to be significantly beneficial. In comparison to the medium cost scenario, many of the actions will be extended to sites and corridors across the region, not just priority sites. This will extend the scope for achieving greater use of services across the region.
To increase physical activity and improve access to leisure opportunities across the region by road based passenger transport	Overall significantly beneficial impact. This package of measures in general will encourage greater levels of physical activity through encouraging a mode shift away from the car to road based passenger transport, which, in general, involved increased levels of walking. Improvements to all interchanges, park and ride sites, improvements to cycling and walking links between all interchanges and measures included to enhance network coverage will all contribute to achieving this objective.
To provide for and improve the safety of passengers when travelling on the road based passenger transport network	Overall significant benefit. There are a number of actions designed specifically to improve the safety of passengers, these include improvements to all interchanges (including staffing, lighting, CCTV), ensuring all vehicles are accessible, improved driver training, CCTV on all vehicles and lighting at all bus stops. Delivery of these actions will be across the region and not just at priority sites, therefore maximising the benefits for all passengers.
To increase connectivity between road based passenger transport services and between different modes of transport	Overall significant benefit. Improvements to all interchanges and development of new park and ride sites, an approach to passenger safety that considers the whole journey, development of the existing bus network, development of multi-operator/multi-journey tickets and smartcards and introduction of quality partnerships

	will all provide a positive contribution towards this objective. Improvements will be implemented across the region and not just focussed on priority sites and corridors.
To strengthen the links between land-use planning and provision of road based passenger transport	Measures included in this package that will strengthen the links between land use planning and road based passenger transport include measures to improve integration and connectivity between services and to develop region wide development control standards and a region wide parking strategy. Provision of funding to establish new services and improvements to infrastructure may come from developers of new sites. Overall this package will have a moderate to significant beneficial impact on this objective. There are no actions which will have a negative impact on this objective.
Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	It is not anticipated that there will be any technical constraints to the delivery of this package.
Operational:	There are not thought to be any significant operational constraints to the delivery of this package. Joint working between a number of stakeholders will be required, however this happens already to a certain extent and is not thought to be a barrier to implementation.
Financial:	This is the high cost scenario of the three that have been developed. A wide range of improvements to infrastructure and services across the region are identified within this package. These actions will bring benefits to people across the region and all passengers on the network, however the extent to which improvements can be made will be dependent on funding. TACTRAN will need to source additional funding from external sources and key stakeholders in order to implement the full range of actions contained within this package. There is also much uncertainty relating to funding provision at present and TACTRAN will need to respond to these changes accordingly. This is an ambitious package of measure, and the availability of funding may restrict the ability of TACTRAN and the local authorities to deliver this package as a whole.
Public:	It is felt that there are no actions contained within this package that are not acceptable to the public or to key stakeholders, however consultation responses will feed into a more detailed appraisal of this aspect.
Rational for selection / rejection of proposal	Summary: Of the three packages, this package of options best meets the objectives of the strategy.

Conclusions of initial appraisal

- 2.2 The relative merits of each package of measures have been appraised with the high cost scenario emerging as the package that best meets the objectives of this strategy.
- 2.3 Following completion of the stakeholder consultation on the draft strategy, all responses received were taken into account in the development of the final strategy. A more detailed implementability appraisal was also undertaken, taking into account the comments received from stakeholders and from TACTRAN. This provided an important step in identifying the preferred and optimum package of measures that make up the final strategy.
- 2.4 During this process, some actions were removed or amended from the preferred package to take account of consultation comments.

Preferred package

- 2.5 The preferred package was developed following appraisal of the low, medium and high cost scenarios and consultation on the draft strategy. Full details of the results of the consultation on the draft strategy can be found in the accompanying Consultation Report.
- 2.6 Although the high cost scenario best meets all the objectives, the appraisal and consultation highlighted that cost of delivering it may prove prohibitive. TACTRAN would need to source additional funding from external sources and key stakeholders in order to implement the full range of actions contained within the high cost scenario. There is also much uncertainty relating to funding provision at present and TACTRAN would need to respond to these changes accordingly.
- 2.7 As a result the medium cost scenario has been used as the basis for development of the preferred strategy, with some elements of the high cost scenario included within it. The medium cost scenario is still an ambitious package of measures but it is felt more likely that TACTRAN and the local authorities will have the financial resources to deliver the package as a whole.
- 2.8 The strategy document provides the details of the preferred strategy policies and the full delivery plan. Table 2.4 below provides an appraisal of the preferred policy principles against the strategy objectives. The purpose of the appraisal at this stage is to ensure that the preferred strategy continues to meet the objectives of the strategy and also to assist in the prioritisation of policies and actions. The objective weightings developed in the RTS have been used to assist in prioritisation. The RTS provides a weighting for each category of objectives and these have been applied to the objectives of this strategy in the table below.

Appraisal: Preferred package

Scale of assessment: ✓ - Slight benefit, ✓✓ - Moderate benefit, ✓✓✓ - Significant benefit, o - neutral, X – slight negative, XX – moderate negative, XXX – significant negative impact.

TABLE 2.4 APPRAISAL AGAINST OBJECTIVES: PREFERRED PACKAGE

Strategic Themes		Objectives												Total	Weighted total ³
Code	Name	Accessibility, equality and social inclusion				Economy		Environment		Health & Wellbeing	Safety and security	Integration			
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12		
Network Coverage															
NC1	Access to key destinations	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓	✓✓✓	21	868
NC2	Pattern and frequency of bus services	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	22	924
NC3	Supported bus services	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	22	861
NC4	Premium & niche market	✓	✓	✓	o	✓	o	o	✓✓	✓	o	✓✓	o	9	394
NC5	New development	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	21	1068
NC6	Transport with care	o	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	o	4	97
Network Quality and Performance															
QP1	Existing interchanges	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	16	593
QP2	New interchanges	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	24	910
QP3	P&R	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	18	742

³ Calculated by multiplying the number of ticks for each measure by the weighting for each objective and totalling the score across all objectives for each measure.

Strategic Themes		Objectives												Total	Weighted total ³
Code	Name	Accessibility, equality and social inclusion				Economy		Environment		Health & Wellbeing	Safety and security	Integration			
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12		
QP4	Cycle and walking	✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	24	1018
QP5	Buses	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	o	o	11	279
QP6	CT/DRT vehicles	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	o	o	19	567
QP7	Bus stop infrastructure	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	✓	17	656
QP8	Environmental responsibility	o	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	o	o	o	✓✓	5	84
QP9	Whole journey approach	o	✓✓	o	o	✓	o	o	✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	10	433
QP10	CCTV	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	9	320
QP11	Staff at interchanges	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	9	320
QP12	Lighting	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	12	351
QP13	Driver training	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	9	320
QP14	User safety	o	✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	o	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	o	12	377
QP15	Mobility difficulties	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	o	✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	16	510
QP16	Bus priority	o	✓	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓	10	445
QP17	PIPS	o	✓✓	✓	✓	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	✓✓✓	o	15	601
QP18	Parking	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	15	616
QP19	Travel demand management	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	o	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	✓✓	✓✓	14	535
QP20	Concessionary fares	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	o	o	15	549

Strategic Themes		Objectives												Total	Weighted total ³
Code	Name	Accessibility, equality and social inclusion				Economy		Environment		Health & Wellbeing	Safety and security	Integration			
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12		
QP21	Integrated ticketing	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	o	11	414
QP22	Smartcards	o	✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	✓	✓	o	o	✓	o	7	206
QP23	Salary Sacrifice Scheme	o	✓✓✓	o	✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	o	o	o	o	9	419
QP24	Travel discount Schemes	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	o	13	530
QP25	Access to health	o	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	o	o	✓	o	o	o	o	9	227
QP26	Quality partnerships	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	26	955
QP27	Enforcement	o	o	o	o	o	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	o	o	o	o	5	240
QP28	CT/DRT booking	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	o	o	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓	o	16	617
QP29	Funding	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓	25	943
QP30	Group travel	✓✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	o	✓✓	o	18	786
QP31	Information provision	✓	✓✓	✓	✓✓✓	✓	o	o	✓✓✓	✓	✓	✓✓✓	o	16	553
	Total	37	66	45	39	39	23	22	87	51	47	46	24	526	19,920
RTS weightings		90				143		51		46	29	79			
		18	32.5	21.6	18.9	90.1	52.9	10.2	40.8	46	29	52.1	26.9		

Prioritisation

- 2.9 Each measure was scored against its contribution to achieving each objective. The weightings for the objectives of the Regional Transport Strategy were then applied to the scoring in order to prioritise the strategic themes of the strategy.
- 2.10 The table below shows the strategy's strategic themes in order of priority following the appraisal and weighting process.

TABLE 2.5 STRATEGIC THEMES PRIORITISED

Strategic theme			
Priority	Code	Name	Weighted score
1	QP26	Quality partnerships	955
2	QP29	Funding	943
3	NC2	Pattern and frequency of services	924
4	QP2	New interchanges	910
5	QP4	Cycling and walking	909
6	NC1	Access to key destinations	868
7	NC3	Supported bus services	861
8	QP30	Group travel	786
9	NC5	New development	768
10	QP3	Park and Ride	742
11	QP7	Bus stop infrastructure	656
12	QP28	CT/DRT booking	617
13	QP18	Parking	616
14	QP31	Information provision	605
15	QP17	PIPS	601
16	QP1	Existing interchanges	593
17	QP6	CT/DRT vehicles	567
18	QP20	Concessionary fares	549
19	QP19	Travel demand management	535
20	QP24	Travel discount scheme	530
21	QP15	Mobility difficulties	510
22	QP16	Bus priority	445
23	QP9	Whole journey approach	433
24	QP23	Salary Sacrifice scheme	419
25	QP21	Integrated ticketing	414
26	NC4	Premium and nice markets	394
27	QP14	User safety	377
28	QP12	Lighting	351

Strategic theme			
Priority	Code	Name	Weighted score
29=	QP10	CCTV	320
29=	QP11	Staff at interchanges	320
29=	QP13	Driver training	320
32	QP5	Buses	279
33	QP27	Enforcement	240
34	QP25	Access to health	227
35	QP22	Smartcards	206
36	NC6	Transport with care	97
37	QP8	Environmental responsibility	84

- 2.11 It should be noted that this assessment and prioritisation only scores the relevant contribution of each action against the objectives of this strategy and then multiplies this against the weightings set out in the RTS. It does not take into account the cost of implementation which is considered for the package as a whole in the Appraisal Summary Table in Table 2.6.
- 2.12 As a result of this process some themes may emerge as particularly important as they provide a positive contribution across a large number of objectives. This assessment should not be taken to mean that those themes with a lower priority are not important, rather they may provide a strong contribution but to a fewer number of objectives.
- 2.13 Key actions for each of these strategic themes, with the exception of cycling and walking, park and ride, parking and travel demand management, are contained within the delivery plan and prioritised using the information in the table above. Detailed actions for cycling and walking, park and ride, parking and travel demand management are contained within separate strategies.

TABLE 2.6 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLE: PREFERRED PACKAGE

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:		TACTRAN	
Proposal Name:	Bus and Community / Demand Responsive Transport Strategy – Preferred package	Name of Planner:	Michael Cairns (TACTRAN)
Proposal Description:	<p>This strategy sets out the principles and short, medium and long term actions by which TACTRAN will maintain and improve the bus, community and demand responsive transport network across the region.</p> <p>This package contains a number of the actions that are also contained within the low and medium cost packages as well as a range of additional actions more focussed on delivery of improvements across the whole region.</p>	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	Capital costs/grant:
			<i>Annual revenue support:</i>
			<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt:</i>
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)		Amount of Application:	<i>Sum: Costs will be in the order of £</i>
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	This strategy covers the TACTRAN Regional Transport Partnership area which encompasses the local authority areas of Angus, Dundee City, Perth and Kinross and Stirling. The region includes parts of the Loch Lomond and Trossachs and Cairngorms National Parks.		
Social Context:	The total population of the region is currently around 475,000 people. It is forecast to remain relatively stable during the lifetime of this strategy. Almost two thirds of the region's population live in the largest cities and towns of Dundee (145,600), Perth (43,500), Stirling (41,000), Arbroath (22,800), Forfar (13,200) and Montrose (10,800). Approximately 10% of the population lives in small towns of between 3,000 – 10,000 people and a quarter of the population lives in rural communities of populations less than 3,000 people. Approximately 31% of TACTRAN households do not have access to a car – this rises to over 48% for lone		

	parent households and to 69% for single pensioner households. Access to healthcare facilities for those without access to a car is a key issue, particularly following centralisation of services.
Economic Context:	The RTS highlights that there are connectivity problems between existing and new locations of housing, employment and key services in certain parts of the region. There is dispersed economic activity, and ongoing dispersion of population out of traditional centres which is increasing the need to travel. Timing, speed, frequency and cost of public transport options to major centres is not perceived to be optimal. Tourism is a key sector of the region's economy and there is a need for increased promotion of the region as a tourist destination. General congestion within the city and town centres at peak times has an impact on bus reliability and links to external markets.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
To ensure that everyone across the region has access to a key regional centre, where they can access a range of services, facilities and opportunities	Overall, this package of measures brings moderate benefits towards achieving this objective. This package focuses on implementing improvements priority existing and new interchange sites, including park and ride, enhancing the accessibility of the bus fleet, reviewing the performance and coverage of the existing bus fleet, providing funding to establish new services promote integrated ticketing and Smartcard technology.
To remove physical, financial and perceptual barriers to accessing road based passenger transport services and infrastructure	Overall significant benefits towards achieving this objective. Improvements to priority existing and new interchange sites will aim to ensure they are safe and secure, clean, well lit, well signed and user friendly, provide clear information, comfortable, accessible and well linked to the walking / cycling network. Such improvements will contribute to removing many perceptual and accessibility barriers to the network. Enhancements to bus stops on priority corridors and development of good practice guidance will also contribute to this objective as will a range of safety improvements and actions to facilitate the delivery of travel discount and Salary Sacrifice schemes. Many actions within this package will bring a significant benefit to this objective. None of the actions contained within this package are predicted to have a negative impact on achieving this objective.
To enable patients and visitors to access necessary health facilities by road based passenger transport	Overall significant benefits. This package of measures includes actions to increase the proportion of low floor vehicles, to ensure that bus stops on corridors operating with low floor vehicles are enhanced to complement this, to review of the CT/DRT and supported bus service provision, develop services for high care travel needs, develop publicity for health needs transport and guidance on maximum travel times to health facilities. No actions are predicted to have a negative impact on this objective.
To ensure a level of information provision across the whole road based passenger transport network that promotes its use and does not hinder accessibility	This package contains a range of actions designed to enhance information provision and to complement the regional information strategy that is being developed in parallel to this strategy. Key actions that will significantly contribute to this objective include supporting the delivery of CT/DRT information and booking co-ordination centres, providing advice to travellers who may be using services for the first time and integration of development and marketing of the bus network with travel demand measures. Many of the actions within

	<p>this package will contribute to this objective and overall the preferred package will have a moderately positive impact on the objectives. The main policies and actions for information provision in the region are contained within a separate strategy. There are not anticipated to be any negative impacts on this objective.</p>
<p>To ensure that key employment, education, retail and tourism locations are linked to the passenger transport network by a service that meets the needs of the local economy</p>	<p>This package contains a number of actions that will benefit this objective and overall the benefit will be moderate to significantly beneficial. Actions to improve network coverage are particularly relevant to this objective. Enhancements to the accessibility of infrastructure and vehicles will also enhance access to these sites for those with mobility difficulties.</p>
<p>To achieve improvements in journey times and the reliability of the region's road based passenger transport network</p>	<p>Overall moderate to significant benefit. This package contains actions to facilitate delivery of bus priority on all strategic corridors, Punctuality Improvement Partnerships, delivery of a region wide parking strategy and implementation of Quality Partnerships, all of which will contribute towards this objective. Greater enforcement of parking regulations will help to reduce the delays to buses caused by parked cars in town centres and in bus lanes.</p>
<p>To enhance the environmental standards of the road based passenger transport fleet and infrastructure</p>	<p>Actions to promote sustainable construction, maintenance and operations at all existing facilities, to facilitate improvements to lighting, implementation of quality partnerships can all have a positive impact on this objective as they provide significant opportunity to integrate more sustainable vehicles and infrastructure into the network. Overall, this package will bring a moderate to significant benefits against this objective.</p>
<p>To achieve greater use of road based passenger transport services in place of travel by private car</p>	<p>The majority of policies and actions contained within this package will bring a significant positive benefit to achieving this objective. The majority of actions are aimed at making the road based passenger transport network and fleet more attractive to all users and will therefore contribute to encouraging a mode shift away from the private car. Overall the impact on this objective is predicted to be significantly beneficial.</p>
<p>To increase physical activity and improve access to leisure opportunities across the region by road based passenger transport</p>	<p>Overall moderately beneficial impact. This package of measures in general will encourage greater levels of physical activity through encouraging a mode shift away from the car to road based passenger transport, which, in general, involves increased levels of walking. Improvements to key interchanges, park and ride sites, improvements to cycling and walking links between interchanges and measures included to enhance network coverage will all contribute to achieving this objective.</p>
<p>To provide for and improve the safety of passengers when travelling on the road based passenger transport network</p>	<p>Overall significant benefit. There are a number of actions designed specifically to improve the safety of passengers, these include improvements to key interchanges (including staffing, lighting, CCTV), increasing the proportion of accessible vehicles, improved driver training, CCTV on vehicles and lighting at bus stops.</p>
<p>To increase connectivity between road based passenger transport services and between different modes of transport</p>	<p>Overall significant benefit. Improvements to key interchanges and development of new park and ride sites, an approach to passenger safety that considers the whole journey, development of the existing bus network, development of multi-operator/multi-journey tickets and smartcards and introduction of quality partnerships will all provide a positive contribution towards this objective</p>
<p>To strengthen the links between land-use planning and provision of road based</p>	<p>Measures included in this package that will strengthen the links between land use planning and road based passenger transport including measures to improve integration and connectivity between services and to</p>

passenger transport	develop a consistent approach to development control standards and a region wide parking strategy. Provision of funding to establish new services and improvements to infrastructure may come from developers of new sites. Overall this package will have a moderate to significant beneficial impact on this objective. There are no actions which will have a negative impact on this objective.
---------------------	---

Implementability Appraisal

Technical:	It is not anticipated that there will be any technical constraints to the delivery of this package.
Operational:	There are not thought to be any significant operational constraints to the delivery of this package. Partnership and joint working between a number of stakeholders and delivery bodies will be required, however this happens already to a certain extent and is not thought to be a barrier to implementation.
Financial:	The preferred package is made up of a combination of actions from the medium and high cost packages. A wide range of improvements to infrastructure and services across the region are identified within this package. These actions will bring benefits to people across the region and all passengers on the network. This package was developed in order to provide an ambitious yet affordable delivery plan for the lifetime of the strategy.
Public:	It is not felt that there are any actions contained within this package that are not acceptable to the public or to key stakeholders. Consultation has been a key element of the development of the strategy with stakeholders consulted on the issues and objectives and then again on the draft strategy. All comments received have been taken on board in the development of the final strategy.

Rational for selection / rejection of proposal	Summary: Of the scenarios developed, this package of options best meets the objectives of the strategy whilst at the same time balancing the cost and ability of TACTRAN and its constituent local authorities to deliver the policies and actions contained within the strategy.
---	--

Government's Objectives for Transport

Objective	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	Significant benefit	A range of actions are included in this package to address vehicle emissions from the road based public transport fleet. In addition, the majority of actions contained within this package are designed to make the road based passenger transport network more effective, efficient and attractive, which will in turn contribute to encouraging a mode shift away from the private car.
Safety:	Significant benefit	A range of actions to enhance safety and the perceptions of safety for passengers on the network. These include infrastructure improvements such as CCTV provision and lighting and information provision.
Economy:	Significant benefit	The strategy addresses the need to enhance access to key employment, education, retail and tourism sites across the region and measures are included in this package to improve the coverage of the road based passenger transport network and improve opportunities

		for interchange. A number of actions are also included to improve journey times and the reliability of services through measures such as bus priority and Punctuality Improvement Partnerships.
Integration:	Significant benefit	This package of measures aims to not only improve integration between different road based passenger transport services, but also improve integration with other modes of transport, including walking and cycling. A range of actions are included to enhance interchange provision and improve facilities for park and ride. Ensuring appropriate information is available before and throughout the journey is also a key element of this package which supports the regional information strategy that is also currently being developed.
Accessibility & Social Inclusion:	Significant benefit	A key focus of this package of measures is to improve accessibility for all, and particularly for those without access to a private car and those with mobility difficulties. A range of actions are included in this package to enhance the coverage of the network and improve access to key regional centres, employment, education, retail and tourism locations, key health facilities and to leisure opportunities. Improvements to existing and creation of new interchange points will facilitate this as will ensuring vehicles and associated infrastructure are fully accessible. Using CT/DRT services to fill the gaps in the network that can't be met by scheduled services will significantly work towards improving accessibility for all and reducing social exclusion.

CONTROL SHEET

Project/Proposal Name: TACTRAN BUS AND CT/DRT STRATEGY

Document Title: Appraisal Report

Client Contract/Project Number:

SDG Project/Proposal Number: 207817-A

ISSUE HISTORY

Issue No.	Date	Details
1	May 2008	

REVIEW

Originator: KKM

Other Contributors:

Review By: Print: Graham Read

Sign: _____

DISTRIBUTION

Clients: Mike Cairns, TACTRAN

Steer Davies Gleave:

